



**FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS**

Volume I

**Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

Fall 1993

**These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.**

04
32
11
1

ACT-7038

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 24 1993

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS**

Volume I

**Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto**

Fall 1993

**These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.**



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/firstnationslawc01mack_0

TABLE OF CONTENTS*

	Page
Volume I	
I. INTRODUCTION	
Georges Erasmus and Joe Sanders, <i>Canadian History: An Aboriginal Perspective</i> , in <i>Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada</i> (Englestad & Bird eds. 1992) 3-11	1
Alan D. McMillan, <i>Native Peoples and Cultures of Canada</i> (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1988)	8
Some Facts and Figures	27
II. THE POLITICS OF INDIGENOUS DIFFERENCE	
The Justice System and Aboriginal People, in 1 Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba (1991) 115-117	33
Fred Plain, <i>A Treatise on the Rights of the Aboriginal Peoples of the Continent of North America</i> , in <i>The Quest for Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights</i> (Boldt & Long eds. 1985), 31-40	35
Russel Lawrence Barsh and James Youngblood Henderson, <i>The Road: Indian Tribes and Political Liberty</i> (1980), 270-79	42
Will Kymlicka, <i>Liberalism, Community and Culture</i> (1991)	44
III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	
R. v. Sparrow, [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075	49
IV. ABORIGINAL TITLE	
A. The Royal Proclamation	
The Royal Proclamation of 1763, R.S.C. 1970, App. II, No. 1	67

*I am grateful to Rebecca Netley for her able assistance in helping to put these materials together.

Brian Slattery, <i>The Hidden Constitution: Aboriginal Rights in Canada</i> (1984), 32 Amer. J. Comp. Law 361, at 368-72	68
B. The Marshall Trilogy	
<i>Johnson v. M'Intosh</i> , 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 543 (1823)	73
<i>Cherokee Nation v. Georgia</i> , 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831) ...	77
<i>Worcester v. Georgia</i> , 31 U.S. (6 Pet.) 515 (1832)	81
C. Canadian Principles	
<i>St. Catherines Milling and Lumber Co. v. The Queen</i> (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.)	91
<i>Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia</i> (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 (S.C.C.)	97
<i>Hamlet of Baker Lake v. Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development</i> , [1980] 1 F.C. 518 (F.C.T.D.)	111
D. Recent Developments	
<i>Guerin v. The Queen</i> (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.)	126
<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	139
<i>Mabo v. Queensland</i> , [1992] 5 C.N.L.R. 1 (Aust. H.C.) ...	159
V. THE DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY	
<i>Douglas Sanders, The Constitution, the Provinces, and Aboriginal People, in Governments in Conflict: Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada</i> (Long & Boldt eds., 1988), 151-52	175
A. Federal Jurisdiction	
<i>Re Eskimos</i> , [1939] 2 D.L.R. 417 (S.C.C.)	177
Note on <i>R. v. Derricksan</i> , 60 D.L.R. (3d) 140 (B.C.C.A.); (1976), 71 D.L.R. (3d) 159 (S.C.C.)	181
B. Provincial Jurisdiction	
<i>Kruger and Manuel v. The Queen</i> (1977), 75 D.L.R. (3d) 434 (S.C.C.)	182

<i>Four B. Manufacturing v. United Garment Workers of America</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.)	187
<i>R. v. Sutherland</i> (1980), 113 D.L.R. (3d) 374 (S.C.C.) ..	194
<i>Dick v. The Queen</i> (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 33 (S.C.C.) ..	196
<i>Jack and Charlie v. The Queen</i> (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.)	204
<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	211
<i>R. v. Alphonse</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.)	212

VI. TREATIES

A. Introduction

<i>Danial J. Kuhlen, A Layperson's Guide to Treaty Rights in Canada</i> (1985)	215
--	-----

B. The Classical Approach

<i>R. v. Syliboy</i> , [1929] 1 D.L.R. 307 (N.S. Co. Ct.)	230
---	-----

C. The Contractual Model

<i>Pawis v. The Queen</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 602 (F.C.T.D.)	236
--	-----

<i>Indian Chiefs of Alberta, "Citizens Plus," in The Only Good Indian</i> (1983)	241
--	-----

<i>Johnston v. The Queen</i> (1966), 56 D.L.R. (2d) 749 (Sask. C.A.)	243
--	-----

<i>R. v. Sikyea</i> (1964), 43 D.L.R. (2d) 150 (N.W.T.C.A.) ...	250
---	-----

<i>Sikyea v. The Queen</i> , [1964] S.C.R. 642 (S.C.C.)	250
---	-----

<i>R. v. George</i> (1966), 55 D.L.R. (2d) 386 (S.C.C.)	251
---	-----

D. Recent Developments

<i>Simon v. The Queen</i> (1985), 24 D.L.R. (4th) 390 (S.C.C.)	255
--	-----

<i>Horse v. The Queen</i> (1988), 47 D.L.R. (4th) 526 (S.C.C.)	265
--	-----

<i>Horseman v. The Queen</i> , [1990] 4 W.W.R. 97 (S.C.C.)	271
<i>R. v. Sioui</i> , [1990] 70 D.L.R. (4th) 427 (S.C.C.)	284
Bruce W. Hodgins and Jamie Benidickson, <i>The Temagami Experience</i> (1989), 267	299
<i>A.G. Ontario v. Bear Island Foundation</i> (1991), 83 D.L.R. (4th) 381 (S.C.C.)	301
<i>Sannichton Marina Ltd. v. Claxton</i> (1987), 18 B.C.L.R. (2d) 217 (B.C.S.C.)	303

VII. THE INDIAN ACT

A. General Principles

Leroy Little Bear, <i>Indian Government Pursuant to the Indian Act, in Pathways to Self-Determination: Canadian Indians and the Canadian State</i> (Little Bear, Boldt & Long eds. 1984)	308
<i>Logan v. Styres</i> (1959), 20 D.L.R. (2d) 416 (Ont. H.C.) ..	314
<i>R. v. Gingrich</i> (1958), 29 W.W.R. 471 (Alta. App. Div.) ..	318
<i>A.G.B.C. v. Wale</i> (1987), 9 B.C.L.R. (2d) 333 (B.C.C.A.)	321
Frank Cassidy and Robert L. Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 40-50	330

B. "Marrying Out"

<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1970, c. I-16	339
<i>Lavell v. A.G. Canada</i> (1973), 38 D.L.R. (3d) 481 (S.C.C.)	341
<i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> , 36 U.N. GOAR Supp. (No. 40) Annex XVIII; U.N. Doc. A/36/40 (1981)	351
<i>Indian Act</i> , R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5	357
Report to Parliament, <i>Implementation of the 1985 Changes to the Indian Act</i> (1987), 8-11	359
<i>Enough is Enough: Aboriginal Women Speak Out</i> (Silman ed. 1987), 215-47	363
Catharine A. MacKinnon, <i>Feminism Unmodified: Discourses</i>	

on Life and Law (1987), 63-69 380

VIII. ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE

A. Introduction

Philip Zylberberg, Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community? (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 75-79 384

B. "The Best Interests of the Child"

Racine v. Woods (1983), 1 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.) 388

B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services (1988), 51 Man. Rep. (2d) 245 (Man. C.A.) 398

B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 291 403

Tom v. Winnipeg Children's Aid Society (1982), 2 W.W.R. 212 (Man. C.A.) 404

C. Recent Developments

Philip Zylberberg, Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community? (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 81-83 406

C.J.K. v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto, [1989] 4 C.N.L.R. 75 (Ont. Prov. Ct.) 409

Re Family and Child Service Act of British Columbia, [1990] 4 C.N.L.R. 14 (B.C. Prov. Ct.) 416

Jane Doe v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba (1990), 72 D.L.R. (4th) 738 (Man. Q.B.) 424

IX. RIGHTS OF THE METIS PEOPLE

Catherine Bell, Who Are the Métis People in Section 35(2)? (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 351 427

Paul Chartrand, Aboriginal Rights: The Dispossession of the Métis (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. 457 436

Dumont v. A.G. Canada (1988), 52 D.L.R. (4th) 25 (Man. C.A.) 448

Dumont v. A. G. Canada (1990), 67 D.L.R. (4th) 159

(S.C.C.)	458
<i>R. v. McPherson</i> , [1992] 4 C.N.L.R. 144 (Man. Prov. Ct.)	459

Volume II

X. FIRST NATIONS AND THE CHARTER

<i>Mary Ellen Turpel, Aboriginal Peoples and the Canadian Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences</i> (1989-90), 6 Can. Human Rights Yrbk. 3	471
<i>Eastmain Band v. Gilpin</i> , [1988] 3 C.N.L.R. (Que. Prov. Ct.)	476
<i>Manitoba Rice Farmers Association v. Manitoba Human Rights Commission</i> (1987), 50 Man. R. (2d) 92 (Q.B.)	486
<i>R. v. Willcocks</i> (July 7, 1992, Ont. C.J.)	497
<i>Norris v. Thomas</i> , [1992] 2 C.N.L.R. 139 (B.C.S.C.)	505

XI. ABORIGINAL PEOPLE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE

<i>R. v. Machekequonabe</i> (1898), 28 O.R. 309 (Div. Ct.)	513
<i>Re Stacey and Montour and the Queen</i> (1981), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 61 (Que. C.A.)	515
<i>Michael Jackson, In Search of the Pathways to Justice: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Aboriginal Communities</i> , [1992] U.B.C. L. Rev. 147, at 148-160	518
<i>R. v. Moses</i> (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.)	531
<i>Law Reform Commission of Canada, Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice</i> (Report No. 34, 1991), at 13-23	557
<i>Bryan Schwartz, A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?</i> (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77	564

XII. ABORIGINAL GOVERNMENT

A. Introduction

<i>Chief Ovide Mercredi, First Nations and Self-Determination, in Human Rights in the Twenty-First</i>	
--	--

Century (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 161-66 ..	574
Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 160-66	579
Roger Gibbons, <i>Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government</i> , in <i>Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization</i> (Ponting ed. 1988), 369-377	583
B. Aboriginal Government and Constitutional Reform	
Kathy L. Brock, <i>The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox</i> (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272	590
J. Edward Chamberlin, <i>Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord</i> , in <i>Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord</i> (Swinton & Rogerson eds., 1988), 11-19	599
<i>Re Native Women's Association of Canada and The Queen</i> (1992), 95 D.L.R. (4th) 106 (Fed. C.A.)	607
<i>Draft Legal Text of the Charlottetown Accord</i> (October 9, 1992)	615
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , July 27, 1993, A2	622
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , July 28, 1993, A21	623
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , July 28, 1993, A20	624
C. Aboriginal Government and the Courts	
Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, <i>Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow</i> (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 498	625
Hamar Foster, <i>Forgotten Arguments: Aboriginal Title and Sovereignty in Canada Jurisdiction Act Cases</i> (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 343	629
Brian Slattery, <i>First Nations and the Constitution: A Question of Trust</i> (1992), 71 Can. Bar Rev. 261	638
Kent Roach, <i>Remedies for Violations of Aboriginal Rights</i> (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 498	646
D. Aboriginal Government and the Land Claims Process	
Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its</i>	

<i>Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 135-55	657
Donald Purich, <i>The Inuit and Their Land</i> (1992)	671
<i>Report of the British Columbia Claims Task Force</i> (1991), 16-71	680
E. Aboriginal Government and Institutional Design	
David C. Hawkes and Allan M. Maslove, <i>Fiscal Arrangements for Aboriginal Self-Government</i> , in <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Government Responsibilities: Exploring Federal and Provincial Roles</i> (Hawkes & Maslove eds., 1989), 103-106	732
Noel Lyon, <i>Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services</i> (1984), at 48-69	735
C.E.S. Franks, <i>Public Administration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government</i> (1987)	756
John Weinstein, <i>Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base</i> (1986)	768
F. Aboriginal Government and the Indian Act	
(readings to be supplied)	

XIII. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN THE UNITED STATES

A. General Principles

Robert N. Clinton, Nell Jessup Newton and Monroe E. Price, <i>American Indian Law</i> (3d ed. 1991), 137-164	776
<i>United States v. Kagama</i> , 118 U.S. 375 (1886)	796
<i>Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock</i> , 187 U.S. 554 (1903)	799
<i>Tee-Hit-Ton Indians v. United States</i> , 348 U.S. 272 (1954)	802
<i>Lyng v. Northwest Cemetery Protective Association</i> , 485 U.S. 439 (1988)	807

B. Tribal Government

<i>Talton v. Mayes</i> , 163 U.S. 376 (1896)	823
<i>Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe</i> , 435 U.S. 191	

(1978)	827
<i>Duro v. Reina</i> , 110 Sup. Ct. 2053 (1990)	833
Frank Pommersheim, <i>The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Tribal Bar as an Interpretive Community: An Essay</i> , 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49 (1988)	838

XIV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

Garth Nettheim, <i>Australian Aborigines and the Law</i> (1987), 2 Law & Anthropology 371-84, 399-400	850
Aboriginal Provisional Government, <i>The Australian Constitution: An Aid to Justice or an Accomplice to Oppression</i> (June 4, 1993)	857
<i>The Treaty of Waitangi</i> , 1975 New Zealand Statutes 114, Sch. 1	879
E. Taihakurie Durie, <i>The New Zealand Maorie and the Waitangi Tribunal</i> , in <i>Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century</i> (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 149-59 ..	881

XV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND INTERNATIONAL LAW

Robert Laurence, <i>Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian People: An Essay in Reaction to Professor Williams' Algebra</i> , 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 413 (1988), at 428-30	888
Robert A. Williams, Jr., <i>Learning to Live With Eurocentric Myopia: A Reply to Professor Laurence's Learning to Live With the Plenary Power of Congress Over the Indian Nations</i> , 30 Ariz. L. Rev. 439 (1988), at 454-55	890
<i>Ominayak v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/38/D/167/1984 (Human Rights Committee decision released March 28, 1990)	891
<i>Grand Chief Donald Marshall and the Mikmag Tribal Society v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/205/1986 (Human Rights Committee decision released July 25, 1990)	898
<i>R.L. et al. v. Canada</i> , U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/43/D/358/1989 (Human Rights Committee decision released April 1, 1991)	903

Draft Universal Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous

<i>Peoples</i>	912
S. James Anaya, <i>The Capacity of International Law to Advance Ethnic or Nationality Claims</i> , 75 Iowa L. Rev. 837 (1990)	916

